



**December 16, 2002**

**To: Members, Water Use Efficiency Subcommittee**  
**From: Scott McCreary and Bennett Brooks, CONCUR**  
**Re: Summary: November 5, 2002, WUE Subcommittee Meeting**  
**Cc: Tom Gohring, Water Use Efficiency Program Manager**

---

Below is a brief discussion summary of the Water Use Efficiency Subcommittee meeting held November 5, 2002, in Sacramento. This memorandum is divided into five sections: (1) Background; (2) Participation; (3) Meeting Materials; (4) Discussion Summary; and, (5) Next Steps.

## **I. BACKGROUND**

The WUE Subcommittee meeting was held November 5, 2002. The primary purpose of the meeting was to: (1) be briefed on recent developments on desalination activities and potential; and, (2) review and consider issues related to the WUE Element's Science Program.

## **II. PARTICIPATION**

The following subcommittee members or designated alternates participated in the meeting, either in person or via teleconference: Co-chairs David Guy and Frances Spivy-Weber, Gary Bobker, Roberta Borgonovo, Mary Ann Dickinson, Chris Dundon, Conner Everts, Richard Harris, John Hewitt, Bill Jacoby, Joe Lima, Ed Osann, Michael Stanley-Jones, Mike Hollis and Mike Wade. CALFED Agency participants included Alemi Manucher with DWR, Tracy Slavin and Lucille Billingsley with USBR, Wayne Pierson and Jim Sutton with SWRCB, and Luana Kiger with NRCS.

Also in attendance were the following staff and facilitation support members: WUE Program Manager Tom Gohring, CALFED consultant Mark Roberson, CALFED staffer Hilda Smith, and Scott McCreary and Bennett Brooks, with CONCUR.

Finally, about 15 members of the public attended the meeting.

### III. MEETING MATERIALS

The following meeting materials were developed and distributed to support the WUE Subcommittee's deliberations:

*In advance:*

- Agenda/Discussion Notes
- Updated Draft WUE Implementation Funding Principles
- WUE Approach to Science and Monitoring
- Draft Terms of Reference – WUE Science Review Panel
- Draft Terms of Reference – Appropriate Urban Water Use Measurement
- WUE Program Updates
- Updated WUE Subcommittee Roster

*As handouts:*

- Key Outcomes Memorandum for September 11, 2002, Subcommittee Meeting
- Draft Overview – WUE Implementation Primary Task Schedule
- Draft Conservation Estimates for CALFED Common Assumptions effort
- Various Presentation Materials Related to Desalination Briefings

Materials will, as appropriate, be updated and posted on the CALFED web page.

### IV. DISCUSSION SUMMARY

#### ***Welcome, Introductions and Updates***

The meeting – the fifth of the WUE Subcommittee – began with a brief review of the agenda and self-introductions. Tracy Slavin with the Bureau announced that Lucille Billingsley would be replacing him on the WUE Subcommittee.

#### ***WUE Implementation Funding Policy Principles***

Meeting participants reviewed the most recent version of the draft document, *Water Use Efficiency Implementation Funding Policy Principles and Associated Activities*. The document, once finalized, is intended to guide CALFED and CALFED agency budgetary decisions and inform BD-PAC deliberations related to CALFED-wide funding issues.

Participants offered several final recommended changes. Most were minor clarifications, though at least one substantive issue, summarized below, requires further discussion.

- **User fees.** Several Subcommittee members remained uncomfortable with the most recent version's deletion of user fees as a possible WUE funding source in Principle 2. Participants suggested the "Associated Activities" section of the document be revised to reference ROD-language – both from the WUE and CALFED Finance Plan sections – related to user fees and in-kind contributions.

CONCUR will work with T. Gohring to revise and distribute the document for Subcommittee comment prior to dissemination to others.

***Focus Topic: Desalination***

The meeting focused primarily on a series of presentations and discussions related to recent developments of desalination techniques, practices and projects. Detailed presentations – all of which are available to download on CALFED’s web page – were made by the following people:

- *F. Cesar Lopez, Jr., Senior Water Specialist with the San Diego County Water Authority, provided a broad overview of the history and recent trends related to seawater desalination, both in California and elsewhere. His comments emphasized, in particular, the various benefits, decreased costs and improved technology related to seawater desalination.*
- *Kevin Wattier, General Manager of the Long Beach Water Department, focused his presentation on Long Beach’s research into and interest in developing community-based seawater desalination. His comments focused on outlining the costs, methods and research related to such initiatives.*
- *Ron Enzwelner, Principal, WaterTech Partners, provided an update on the opportunities, technologies, economics and activities related to desalination as part of agricultural drainage efforts. His talk emphasized, in particular, the increasing feasibility of desalination as an agricultural lands drainage strategy.*

All three talks, though differently focused, echoed several common themes that suggest the increased feasibility and usage of desalination in the near future. These included: (1) improved technologies; (2) decreasing costs relative to other water-generating options; (3) ability to generate good water quality; and, (4) the ability to scale plant size.

The presentations triggered an extended discussion among Subcommittee members, with a number of participants articulating interest in ensuring the broader CALFED community is aware of the increasing potential of desalination. This is particularly important, several speakers noted, since (1) desalination was not mentioned in the 2000 CALFED Record of Decision; and, (2) there are currently no effective strategies within CALFED for integrating activities such as desalination which have the potential to deliver multiple benefits across different program elements.

Based on the discussion, Subcommittee Co-Chairs Fran-Spivy Weber and David Guy suggested they provide a brief update on the presentations to the Bay-Delta Public Advisory Committee and recommend that the relevant programs look more closely at the cross-cutting opportunities associated with desalination.

***WUE Science Program***

T. Gohring presented the most recent version of the WUE Year 3 Work Plan, which included a detailed and updated description of the Element’s approach to monitoring and performance measures. In describing the work plan, T. Gohring emphasized his

interest in crafting an approach that fosters an open and technically credible process. He further stressed the critical role that DWR and other agencies are to play in implementing the program.

The proposed approach triggered several questions and concerns among the Subcommittee members. Most broadly, these comments were related to: (1) the completeness and inter-relatedness of the tasks themselves; (2) the description of who would do the tasks; (3) the sources of funding for the tasks; and, (4) the nomenclature being used to describe the tasks.

The discussion further seemed to suggest that, in general, Subcommittee members were in agreement on how to move forward, with participants wanting to see an approach designed to: (1) identify, question and test fundamental assumptions; (2) determine data needs and set consistent data collection standards; (3) use the best available data to make timely and credible projections; and, (4) ensure continual updates of conceptual models, assessments and projections as new and better information is developed. This overarching approach is considered essential if the Program is to support and inform sound decisions – both within WUE and related to broader water management issues, such as storage.

Based on the discussion, the Subcommittee agreed to convene a work team to: (1) attempt to better define the issues to be addressed; and, (2) develop an agreed-upon strategy for moving forward, including relevant policy recommendations, if any.

### ***WUE Program and Related Updates***

Given the amount of time spent discussing desalination and WUE Science-related activities, the Subcommittee did not have time to cover all topics listed under WUE Program and Related Updates. Below is a brief synopsis of the issues discussed.

- **Common Assumptions.** Greg Young provided an update on efforts to estimate region-specific agricultural and urban conservation potential as part of CALFED's "Common Assumptions" modeling initiative. Several Subcommittee members voiced concerns that model-generated estimates – still incomplete and not yet vetted broadly with stakeholders – could be inappropriately interpreted and used within the CALFED decision-making framework.
- **BD-PAC Updates.** F. Spivy-Weber and D. Guy provided brief updates on BD-PAC's consideration of WUE Subcommittee recommendations related to urban certification and agricultural milestones. F. Spivy-Weber noted that several issues related to urban certification, including the proposed regulatory approach, generated concern with some BD-PAC members and will need to be re-addressed and resolved as part of either WUE Element Work Plan development or CALFED Authority discussions.

Other agendized topics were not covered.

## **Public Comments**

Several members of the public asked clarifying questions related to the desalination presentation and other topics.

## **V. NEXT STEPS**

Based on the discussions, participants agreed to a series of next steps intended to facilitate the WUE Subcommittee's deliberations. Primary steps include:

- **WUE Subcommittee Meeting Schedule:** Participants agreed to hold the next WUE Subcommittee meeting on January 17, from 9 a.m. to 1 p.m., in Sacramento. The meeting is to focus primarily on follow-on discussions related to WUE Element Science initiatives. The exact meeting location is to be confirmed at a later date via e-mail.
- **Revisions to WUE Implementation Funding Policy Principles.** Based on Subcommittee discussions, T. Gohring is to work with staff and consultants to finalize revisions to the Funding Policy Principles document. The proposed final version is to be distributed – either via e-mail or at the next WUE Subcommittee meeting – for final confirmation.
- **Revisions to the WUE Element's Approach to Science and Monitoring.** Meeting participants agreed to establish a Work Group to continue revising the language and concepts related to Task 1 (Science & Monitoring) in the WUE Element's Year 3 Work Plan. Work Group participants are to include Bill Jacoby, Manucher Alemi, Fran Spivy-Weber, Michael Stanley-Jones, David Guy, Mary Ann Dickinson, Richard Harris, Mike Hollis, Gary Bobker, Lucille Billingsley and Jim Sutton.
- **Other.** The Subcommittee also stepped out several additional follow-on tasks noted below:
  - Copies of the desalination presentations are to be posted onto the CALFED WUE web page. Subcommittee members are to be notified, via e-mail, once the materials have been posted. Electronic versions of handout materials are also to be posted.
  - Subcommittee members interested in providing comments on the draft "Program Assessment and Work Plan - Year 3" (meeting Attachment 2) agreed to submit specific suggestions, via e-mail, to T. Gohring by Wednesday, November 13.

Any questions or comments regarding this meeting and the WUE Element are to be directed to T. Gohring at 916-651-7102.